

ATA 611
Topics in the Economic and Social History of Turkey:
Social Welfare and Politics in History
Fall 2001

Nadir Özbek

Course Description:

This course analyzes the politics of social welfare in history. We start with contemporary debates on the crisis of welfare state. The crisis of welfare state since the late 1980s and post-modern epistemologies as the informing theoretical framework for historical studies invigorated a reconsideration of the established paradigms in the field of social policy and welfare. The course examines these new historiographical discourses and their political implications, liberal as well as radical. We next analyze historical and theoretical approaches to the emergence of welfare state within the context of modernity and modern state formation. Rather than presenting the emergence of a 'welfare system' as a predetermined progression towards 'modern welfare state,' we analyze the paradoxes of that very course and various social agencies associated with it, and conflict and contestation as well as harmonious relationship among them. After these introductory discussions we focus primarily on the theme of 'social control' as the manifestation of modern politics. We examine both theoretical works and historical studies on western Europe, nineteenth-century Egypt and Ottoman Empire, and early Republican period.

This course aims to provide the students with a theoretical and historical background on social welfare and politics. Though most of the readings are from European historiography, students are encouraged to compile their own bibliographies pertinent to Ottoman and Republican periods and formulate short research projects with a relationship to the issues we are going to discuss in the sessions. During the sessions we will pay particular attention to parallel issues and problems in Ottoman and Turkish history. Depending on their major field students may also formulate research projects related to current social problems and policies in Turkey.

Format:

This course meets once a week for three hours. Eleven sessions will be used to discuss common readings for each week. One or two sessions will be devoted to paper presentations and peer critique.

Assignments:

Weekly Readings: This seminar is organized around common readings as the basis for weekly discussions. Students are to prepare eight short précis (a freewheeling commentary) on some aspect of the week's readings. (30%)

Research Paper: Each student will write a research paper of at least 4,000 words. Paper topics should be chosen to reflect a relationship to one of the discussion sessions in the course. This will help to reduce preparatory reading. Students are encouraged to use 'primary sources' as the basis of their research. Students should submit a paper topic and one or two pages statement during week 5. (40%)

Oral Presentation: Each student will present a summary of his or her research paper in one of the last two sessions. These are not to exceed 20 minutes. (20%)

Peer Critique: Each paper and presentation will be the subject of an oral critique by another student. These are not to exceed 10 minutes. (10%)

WEEK 1: INTRODUCTION

WEEK 2: PAST AND FUTURE OF THE WELFARE STATE

- J. Krieger, "Social Policy in the Age of Reagan and Thatcher," *Socialist Register 1987* (London: 1987), 177-98.
- Gosta Esping-Andersen, "The Three Political Economies of the Welfare State," in *The Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism*, Princeton-New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1990, 9-34.
- Jürgen Habermas, "The New Obscurity: The Crisis of the Welfare State and the Exhaustion of Utopian Energies," in Jürgen Habermas, *The New Conservatism, Cultural Criticism and the Historian's Debate*, Cambridge Massachusetts: The MIT Press, 1989, pp.48-70.
- Jacques Donzelot, "The Mobilization of Society," in Graham Burchell, Colin Gordon & Peter Miller (eds.), *The Foucault Effect, Studies in Governmentality*, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1991, pp.169-180.
- Peter Flora, "Solution or Source of Crisis? The Welfare State in Historical Perspective," in W.J. Mommsen (ed.), *The Emergence of the Welfare State in Britain and Germany*, London: Croom Helm, 1981, pp.343-389.
- Gaston V. Rimlinger, "Comments on Professor Peter Flora's Analytical Perspective of the Welfare State," in W.J. Mommsen (ed.), *The Emergence of the Welfare State in Britain and Germany*, pp.390-394.
- Phil Mizen, "Work-Welfare' and the Regulation of the Poor: The Pessimism of Post-Structuralism," *Capital and Class*, Summer 1998, n.65, pp.35-53.

WEEK 3: SOCIAL WELFARE, PHILANTHROPY, CHARITY: HISTORIOGRAPHICAL APPROACHES

- Georg G. Iggers, *Historiography in the Twentieth Century, From Scientific Objectivity to the Postmodern Challenge*, New England, Wesleyan University Press, 1997.

Part III: History and the Challenge of Postmodernism,
pp.97-148.

- Rifa'at A. Abou-El-Haj, "Historiography in West Asian and North African Studies since Sa'id's Orientalism." In *History after the Three Worlds: Post-Eurocentric Historiographies*, edited by Arif Dirlik, Vinay Bahl and Peter Gran, 67-84. New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc, 2000.
- Colin Jones, "Some recent trends in the history of charity," in Martin Daunton, ed., *Charity, Self-Interest and Welfare in the English Past* (New York: St.Martin's Press, 1996), 51-63.
- Sandra Cavallo, "Charity, Power, and Patronage in Eighteenth-Century Italian Hospitals: The Case of Turin," in Lindsay Granshaw and Roy Porter (eds.), *The Hospital in History*, London & New York: Routledge, 1989, pp.93-122.
- Sandra Cavallo, "The Motivations of Benefactors: An Overview of Approaches to the Study of Charity," in Jonathan Barr and Colin Jones (ed.), *Medicine and Charity Before the Welfare State*, London & New York: Routledge, 1991, pp.46-62.
- Jonathan Barry and Colin Jones (eds.), *Medicine and Charity Before the Welfare State*, pp.1-13.
- Frances Gouda, *Poverty and Political Culture. The Rhetoric of Social Welfare in the Netherlands and France, 1815-1854*, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 1995, pp.1-11.

WEEK 4: THE HISTORICAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE WELFARE STATE

- Joanna Innes, "State, Church and Voluntarism in European Welfare, 1690-1850." In *Charity, Philanthropy and Reform, From the 1690s to 1850*, ed. Hugh Cunningham and Joanna Innes, 15-65. New York: St.Martin's Press, 1998.
- Sandra Cavallo, *Charity and Power in Early Modern Italy. Benefactors and Their Motives in Turin, 1541-1789*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
Chapter 6: "The State System of Relief," pp.225-257.
- Derek Fraser, "The English Poor Law and the Origins of the British Welfare State," in W.J. Mommsen (ed.), *The Emergence of the Welfare State in Britain and Germany*, London: Croom Helm, 1981, pp.9-31.
- Jürgen Tampke, "Bismarck's Social Legislation: a Genuine Breakthrough?" in Derek Fraser, "The English Poor Law and the Origins of the British Welfare State," in W.J. Mommsen (ed.), *The Emergence of the Welfare State in Britain and Germany*, pp.71-83.
- Hans-Peter Ullmann, "German Industry and Bismarck's Social Security System," Derek Fraser, "The English Poor Law and the Origins of the British Welfare State," in W.J. Mommsen (ed.), *The Emergence of the Welfare State in Britain and Germany*, pp.133-149.

WEEK 5: SUBMIT TOPIC STATEMENTS

WEEK 5: THE WELFARE STATE, SOCIOLOGICAL APPROACHES:

George Steinmetz, *Regulating the Social. The Welfare State and Local Politics in Imperial Germany*, Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1993.

Chapter 1: "Social Policy and the German Welfare State," pp.15-40.

Chapter 2: "Toward an Explanation of the Welfare State in Nineteenth-Century Germany," pp.41-54.

Chapter 3: "The Rise of the Social Question and Social Policy in Nineteenth-Century Germany," pp.55-69.

Arif Dirlik, "Culturalism as Hegemonic Ideology and Liberating Practices." In *The Postcolonial Aura, Third World Criticism in the Age of Global Capitalism*, edited by Arif Dirlik, 23-51. Colorado: Westview Press, 1997.

WEEK 6: GENDER AND THE ORIGINS OF WELFARE STATES:

Seth Koven and Sonya Michel, "Introduction: 'Mother Worlds'", in Seth Koven and Sonya Michel (eds.), *Mothers of a New World, Maternalist Politics and the Origins of Welfare States*, New York & London: Routledge, 1993, pp.1-42.

Kathryn Kish Sklar, "The Historical Foundations of Women's Power in the Creation of the American Welfare State, 1830-1930," in Seth Koven and Sonya Michel (eds.), *Mothers of a New World*, pp.43-93.

Seth Koven, "Borderlands: Women, Voluntary Action, and Child Welfare in Britain, 1840 to 1914," in Seth Koven and Sonya Michel (eds.), *Mothers of a New World*, pp.94-135.

Jean H. Quataert, "Woman's Work and the Early Welfare State in Germany: Legislators, Bureaucrats, and Clients Before the First World War," in Seth Koven and Sonya Michel (eds.), *Mothers of a New World*, pp.159-187.

Kathleen Canning, "Social Policy, Body Politics: Recasting the Social Question in Germany, 1875-1900," in Laura L. Reader and Sonya O. Rose (eds.), *Gender and Class in Modern Europe*, Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1996, pp.211-237.

Gisela Bock, "Poverty and Mothers' Rights in the Emerging Welfare States," in Françoise Thebaud (ed.), *A History of Women, Toward a Cultural Identity in the Twentieth Century*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1994, pp.402-432.

Sandra Cavallo, "Charity as Boundary Making: Social Stratification, Gender and the Family in the Italian States (Seventeenth-Nineteenth Centuries)." In *Charity, Philanthropy and Reform, From the 1690s to 1850*, edited by Joanna Innes, 108-129. New York: St.Martin's Press, 1998.

WEEK 7: SOCIAL WELFARE IN THE LATE OTTOMAN EMPIRE AND EARLY REPUBLICAN TURKEY

- Halil İnalçık, "The Ottoman State: A Welfare State," in Halil İnalçık, *An Economic and Social History of the Ottoman Empire*, v.1, 1300-1600, Cambridge University Press, 1994, pp.45-48.
- Ömer Lütfi Barkan, "Şehirlerin Teşekkül ve İnkişaf Tarihi Bakımından Osmanlı İmparatorluğunda İmaret Sitelerinin Kuruluş ve İşleyiş Tarzına Ait Araştırmalar." *İstanbul Üniversitesi İktisat Fakültesi Mecmuası* 23/1-2 (Ekim 1962-Şubat 1963): 239-96.
- Miriam Hoexter, "Waqf Studies in the Twentieth Century: The State of the Art." *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient* 41/4 (1998): 474-495.
- Nazif Öztürk, *Türk Yenileşme Tarihi Çerçevesinde Vakıf Müessesesi*. Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 1995, pp.19-107.
- Oded Peri, "The Waqf as an Instrument to Increase and Consolidate Political Power: The Case of Khasseki Sultan Waqf in Late Eighteenth-Century Ottoman Jerusalem." In *Studies in Islamic Society, Contributions in Memory of Gabriel Baer*, edited by Gabriel R. Warburg and Gad G. Gilbar, 47-61. Haifa: Haifa University Press, 1984.
- Oded Peri, "Waqf and Ottoman Welfare Policy, The Poor Kitchen of Hasseki Sultan in Eighteenth-Century Jerusalem." *Journal of Economic and Social History of the Orient* XXXV: 107-186.
- Nadir Özbek, "Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Sosyal Yardım Uygulamaları: 1839-1918," *Toplum ve Bilim*, 83, Kış 1999/2000, pp.111-132.
- Nadir Özbek, "The Politics of Poor Relief in the Late Ottoman Empire, 1876-1914," *New Perspectives on Turkey*, 21 (Fall 1999): 1-33.
- Zafer Toprak, "Sosyal Politika Tarihimizin İlk Önlemler Paketi: Müessesât-ı Sinaiyede Çocukların ve Kadınların Çalıştırılması (1910)." *Toplum ve Bilim*, no. 27 (1984): 229-237.
- Nicole A.N.M van Os, "Taking Care of Soldiers' Families: The Ottoman State and the Muinsiz Aile Maaşı." In *Arming the State: Military Conscription in the Middle East and Central Asia, 1775-1925*, edited by Erik J. Zürcher. London & New York: I.B. Tauris Publishers, 1999.
- Kathy Libal, "The Children's Protection Society: Nationalizing Child Welfare in Early Republican Turkey," *New Perspectives on Turkey*, 23 (Fall 2000), pp. 53-78.

WEEK 8: SOCIAL CONTROL and the STATE: THEORETICAL APPROACHES-1

- Colin Gordon, "Governmental rationality: an introduction," in Graham Burchell, Colin Gordon & Peter Miller (eds.), *The Foucault Effect, Studies in Governmentality*, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1991, pp.1-51.
- Michel Foucault, "Governmentality," in in Graham Burchell, Colin Gordon & Peter Miller (eds.), *The Foucault Effect*, pp.87-104.
- Giovanna Procacci, "Social Economy and the Government of Poverty," in Graham Burchell, Colin Gordon & Peter Miller (eds.), *The Foucault Effect*, 151-168.

- Graham Burchell, "Peculiar Interests: Civil Society and Governing 'The System of Natural Liberty'," in Graham Burchell, Colin Gordon & Peter Miller (eds.), *The Foucault Effect*, pp.119-150.
- Michael Ignatieff, "State, Civil Society and Total Institutions: A Critique of Recent Social Histories of Punishment," in Stanley Cohen and Andrew Scull (ed.), *State and Social Control, Historical and Comparative Essays*, Oxford: Martin Robertson, 1983, pp.75-105.

WEEK 9: SOCIAL CONTROL and the STATE: THEORETICAL APPROACHES-2

Michel Foucault, *Discipline and Punish, The Birth of the Prison*, New York: Vintage Books, 1995.

Or

Jacques Donzelot, *The Policing of Families*, Baltimore & London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997.

WEEK 10: POVERTY AND SOCIAL CONTROL-HISTORICAL STUDIES: WESTERN EUROPE

Felix Driver, *Power and Pauperism, The Workhouse System, 1834-1884*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.

Introduction, pp.1-5.

1. Policing Society: Government, Discipline and Social Policy, pp.6-17.

2. Social Policy, Liberalism and the Mid-Victorian State, pp.18-31.

Isser Woloch, *The New Regime, Transformation of the French Civic Order, 1789-1820s*, New York & London: W.W. Norton & Company, 1994.

8. The Rise and Fall of Revolutionary Bienfaisance, pp.237-265.

9. Durable Themes: The Repression of Begging; Philanthropy and Self-Help, pp.266-296.

Robert M. Schwartz, *Policing the Poor in Eighteenth-Century France*, Chapel Hill and London: The University of North Carolina Press, 1988.

1. Introduction, pp.1-13.

2. The State and Mendicity, 1656-1724, pp.14-54.

3. The Great Confinement, 1724-1733, pp.55-95.

4. Poverty and Urban Social Control, pp.96-131.

9. Conclusion, pp.243-251.

* Olwen H. Hufton, *The Poor of Eighteenth-Century France, 1750-1789*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1974.

3. An Economy of Makeshifts: (i) Migration, pp.69-106.

4. An Economy of Makeshifts: (ii) The Beggars, pp.107-130.

8. Begging, Vagrancy, and the Law, pp.219-244.

10. Prostitution, pp.306-317.

WEEK 11: POVERTY AND SOCIAL CONTROL-HISTORICAL STUDIES: NINETEENTH-CENTURY EGYPT

Timothy Mitchell, *Colonising Egypt*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991.

2. Enframing, pp.34-62.
3. An Appearance of Order, pp.63-94.
4. After We Captured Their Bodies, pp.95-127.

Mine Ener, "Policing the Egyptian Populace," in Mine Ener, "Managing the Poor in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth-Century Egypt." Ph.D. diss., The University of Michigan, 1996, pp.36-90.

Mine Ener, "Prohibition on Begging and Loitering in Nineteenth-Century Egypt." *Die Welt Des Islams* 39/3: 319-339.

Khaled Fahmy, "The Police and the People in Nineteenth-Century Egypt." *Die Welt Des Islams* 39/3 (1999): 340-377.

WEEK 12: POVERTY AND SOCIAL CONTROL-HISTORICAL STUDIES: LATE OTTOMAN EMPIRE, 1750-1922

Kırlı, Cengiz. "Kahvehaneler ve Hafiyeler: 19.Yüzyıl Ortalarında Osmanlı'da Sosyal Kontrol." *Toplum ve Bilim*, no. 83 (1999/2000): 58-79.

Nadir Özbek, "The State and the Poor in the 'Long Nineteenth Century': 'Beggars' and 'Vagrants' in State Policy and Public Discourse," in 'The Politics of Welfare: Philanthropy, Voluntarism and Legitimacy in the Ottoman Empire, 1876-1914,' Ph.D., Binghamton University, 2001, 29-85.

Ferdan Ergut, "Policing the Poor in the Late Ottoman Empire." *Middle Eastern Studies* (2003 forthcoming).

Ferdan Ergut, "Polis Çalışmaları İçin Kavramsal Bir Çerçeve." *Amme İdaresi Dergisi* 34, no. 1 (2001): 59-78.

Nader Sohrabi, "Creation of the Modern Rational State: The Young Turk Revolutionary Reforms," in 'Constitutionalism, Revolution and State: The Young Turk Revolution of 1908 and the Iranian Constitutional Revolution of 1906 with Comparisons to the Russian Revolution of 1905,' Ph.D., University of Chicago, 1996, pp.514-578.

WEEK 13: NO CLASS: PREPARATION FOR THE PRESENTATIONS

WEEK 14: ORAL PRESENTATIONS

PAPERS DUE: FINAL EXAM WEEK